# On dual triangulations of surfaces 

Alexander Stoimenow<br>Division of Liberal Arts and Sciences, GIST College, Gwangju, Korea<br>Thursday, September 25, 2016<br>Seminar<br>KIAS, Seoul, Korea

## Contents

- Canonical genus bounds hyperbolic volume
- Crossing equivalence, generators
- Enumeration of alternating knots by genus
- Markings / Wicks forms
- Tables of generators
- Further applications of generators
- Back to hyperbolic volume
- The relation between volume and the $s l_{N}$ polynomial
- Independence of maximal volume on number of components


## 1. Canonical genus bounds hyperbolic volume

knot $K \quad S^{1} \longleftrightarrow S^{3}$
link $L$


$K=$ trefoil $\quad L=$ Hopf link

Let $g(K)$ be the genus of $K$, given by

$$
g(K)=\min \{g(S): S \text { is a Seifert surface of } K\}
$$

where a Seifert surface $S$ of $K$ is as

and its genus is $g(S)=\#$ holes of $S$.
$g_{f}(K)$, the free genus, minimal genus of free surfaces $S$ (i.e. $S^{3} \backslash S$ a handlebody).
$g_{c}(K)$, the canonical genus, is the minimal genus of canonical surfaces $S$ (obtained by Seifert's method).

Canonical surfaces are free $\Rightarrow$

$$
g(K) \leq g_{f}(K) \leq g_{c}(K)
$$

These are often (though not always) equalities. In particular:
Definition 1. alternating knots and links
A knot (or link) is alternating if it has a diagram where (along each component) one passes strands under-over.


Theorem 2 (Crowell-Murasugi '59-'61). L alternating knot or link $\Rightarrow$ canonical surface of alternating diagram is of minimal genus $\left(\Rightarrow g(L)=g_{c}(L)\right)$
(W.) Thurston: most knots (and links) $L$ are hyperbolic:

$$
S^{3} \backslash L=\underset{\substack{\text { hyperbolic } \\ \text { 3-space }}}{H^{3}} \quad \underset{\substack{\text { group of } \\ \text { isometries }}}{\Gamma},
$$

and volume is finite: volume of $L, \operatorname{vol}(L)$.
(Convention: $\operatorname{vol}(L):=0$ when $L$ not hyperbolic.)
Theorem 3 (Brittenham).

$$
\begin{equation*}
\sup \left\{\operatorname{vol}(K): g_{c}(K)=g\right\}<\infty . \tag{1}
\end{equation*}
$$

Remark 4. But

$$
\sup \left\{\operatorname{vol}(K): g_{f}(K)=g\right\}=\infty
$$

(B. $g=1$, S. $g \geq 2$ ), thus maximal volume makes little sense for (free) genus. But it does for alternating knots, and sup is the same as (1).

For links use (canonical) Euler characteristic $\chi, \chi_{c} .\left(\right.$ knots: $\left.\chi_{(c)}=1-2 g_{(c)}\right)$ Let

$$
\begin{equation*}
v_{\chi}=\sup \left\{\operatorname{vol}(L): \chi_{c}(L)=\chi\right\} \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

Computation? Estimates? Will return to this after a (long) detour.

## 2. Crossing equivalence, generators

A flype is the move


Definition 5. A $\bar{t}_{2}^{\prime}$ move is a move creating a pair of crossings reverse twist
( $\sim$-)equivalent to a given one:


Alternating diagram generating: $\Longleftrightarrow$ irreducible under flypes and reverse of $\bar{t}_{2}^{\prime}$ moves. For such diagram $D$,

$$
\text { (generating) series of } D:=\left\{\begin{array}{c}
\text { diagrams obtained by flypes } \\
\text { and } \bar{t}_{2}^{\prime} \text { moves on } D
\end{array}\right\} .
$$

generator $:=$ alternating knot whose alternating diagrams are generating.
Theorem 6 (S; Brittenham). The number of generators of given genus is finite.

More precisely (S.): they have $\leq 6 g-3 \sim$-equivalence classes. (For links $-3 \chi$, except $\chi=0$, where the Hopf link is the only generator.)

Definition 7. Call a generator even/odd if it has even/odd crossings. Call it maximal if it has $6 g-3 \sim$-equivalence classes.

Proof of theorem 3. By Thurston's hyperbolic surgery theorem $\Rightarrow$

$$
\sup (\text { series })=\operatorname{vol}(\underline{\text { limit link }})
$$



Let us discard generators which are composite knots:

(Similarly, discard composite and split links.)
Thus we consider only prime generators.

| genus | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| \# prime generators | 2 | 24 | 4,017 | $3,414,819$ |

S-Vdovina; cf. (3) below: (Exponential) growth rate is $\geq 400$ ! Details...

## 3. Enumeration of alternating knots by genus

A fundamental tool is the Flyping theorem.
Theorem 8 (Menasco-Thistlethwaite). Two alternating diagrams of the same (alternating) knot/link are interconvertible by flypes.

In a generator of $k \sim$-equivalence classes, there are $\sim n^{k-1}$ alternating diagrams of $n$ crossings.

M-T helps taking care of flypes and symmetries, and so:
Theorem 9 (S.). Let $a_{n, g}$ be the number of alternating knots of genus $g$ and $n$ crossings. Then the sequence $\left(a_{n, g}\right)_{n=1}^{\infty}$ for fixed $g$ is almost everywhere periodically polynomial (aepp).
I.e., $\exists p_{g}$ (period), $n_{g}$ (initial number of exceptions), and polynomials $P_{g, 1}, \ldots, P_{g, p_{g}} \in \mathbb{Q}[n]$ with

$$
a_{n, g}=P_{g, n \bmod p_{g}}(n) \text { for } n \geq n_{g} .
$$

Another way of writing this:

$$
\left(a_{n, g}\right) \text { aepp } \Longleftrightarrow \sum_{n} a_{n, g} x^{n}=\frac{R_{g}(x)}{\left(x^{p_{g}}-1\right)^{d_{g}}}, \quad R_{g} \in \mathbb{Q}[x]
$$

(where $p_{g}$ is the period and $d_{g}=1+\max _{n} \operatorname{deg} P_{g, n}$ ).
$p_{g}$ is in general huge, but the leading terms of $P_{g, n}$ have only period 2!
Theorem 10 (S.-Vdovina).

$$
\left[P_{g, \text { even } / \text { odd }}\right]_{\max }=\frac{n^{6 g-4}}{(6 g-4)!} \cdot \#\{\text { maximal even/odd generators }\}
$$

Definition 11. A class $\mathcal{C} \subset \mathcal{D}$ of knots is asymptotically dense, if

$$
\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\# \mathcal{C} \cap\{c(K)=n\}}{\# \mathcal{D} \cap\{c(K)=n\}}=1
$$

Example 12. An example aside: non-alternating links are asymptotically dense in the class of all links (Thistlethwaite).

Max generators are special alternating, thus:
Proposition 13 (S.-Vdovina). Among alternating knots of given genus, special alternating ones are asymptotically dense.

Let

$$
C_{g, \text { even/odd }}=\#\{\text { maximal genus } g \text { even/odd generators }\}
$$

A description in $[\mathrm{S}-\mathrm{V}]$ of maximal generators yields:
Theorem 14 (S-V).

$$
\begin{equation*}
400 \leq \liminf _{g \rightarrow \infty} \sqrt[g]{C_{g, *}} \leq \limsup _{g \rightarrow \infty} \sqrt[g]{C_{g, *}} \leq \frac{2^{20}}{3^{6}} \approx 1438.38 \tag{3}
\end{equation*}
$$

[later (S.) $\limsup \leq\left(2^{130 / 7} 31^{2 / 7}\right) / 3^{6} \approx 1425.39$.]
Tool: Wicks forms

## 4. Wicks forms / Markings

Definition 15. A maximal Wicks form $w$ is a cyclic word in the free group over an alphabet with the following 3 conditions:

1) Each letter $a$ and $a^{-1}$ appears exactly once in $w$.
2) $w \ni$ no subwords of the form $a^{ \pm 1} a^{\mp 1}$.
3) (maximality) $a^{ \pm 1} b^{ \pm 1} \in w$ and $b^{ \pm 1} c^{ \pm 1} \in w$ (signs independently choosable) $\Rightarrow c^{ \pm 1} a^{ \pm 1} \in w$ (for proper to be chosen signs).
$w, w^{\prime}$ equivalent up to cyclic permutation and permutation of letters (and inverses)

First studied by Wicks, then Comerford-Edmunds, Culler, Bacher-Vdovina.
(Bacher-Vdovina) duals of 1-vertex triangulations of oriented surfaces:

- number of letters $=6 g-3$ for some $g>0$
- label the edges of a $6 g-3$-gon $X$ by letters of $w$ and reverse the orientation induced from the one of $X$ on edges corresponding to inverses of letters.
- identify the edges labelled by each letter and its inverse according to their orientation.
- surface $S$ orientable of genus $g$. Call $g$ the genus of the Wicks form.
- $\partial X \rightarrow 3$-valent (cubic) graph $G \subset S$ is 1-skeleton of 1-face cell complex (edges of $X \simeq$ letters $a^{ \pm 1}$, vertices $\simeq$ triples in maximality property). Dual is 1 -vertex triangulation.

Definition 16 (S-V). Maximal planar Wicks form $w: \Longleftrightarrow$ its graph $G \subset S$ planar and 3-connected (no $\leq 2$ edges removed disconnect).

Lemma 17.

$$
\left\{\begin{array}{c}
\text { maximal genus } \\
g \text { generators }
\end{array}\right\} \simeq\left\{\begin{array}{c}
\text { maximal planar Wicks } \\
\text { forms of genus } g
\end{array}\right\} .
$$

$G 3$-connected $\stackrel{\text { Whitney's theorem }}{\Longrightarrow} G \subset S^{3}$ unique. $G \subset S$ is determined by a $+/-$ marking of vertices $G$ in planar embedding.
Marking gives Wicks form iff thickening

has one $\partial$ component (knot marking).
Vdovina: 3 elementary operations W forms of genus $g \rightarrow \mathrm{~W}$ forms of genus $g+1$
effect on the graphs: graphic $\alpha, \beta$ and $\gamma$ construction

(We used $\gamma$ to prove the left inequality in (3).)
More about this later...

## 5. Tables of generators

If we sort the 24 prime generators of genus $g=2$ according to number of crossings and $\sim$-equivalence classes, we obtain the following table:

| \#~ | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 4 |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 5 | 1 | 1 | 2 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  | 5 |
| 6 |  | 1 | 1 | 1 | 3 |  |  | 1 |  | 7 |
| 7 |  |  |  | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 |  |  | 5 |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  | 2 | 2 |  |  | 4 |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| total | 1 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 5 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 1 | $\mathbf{2 4}$ |

(For $g=1$ the 'table' is not very revealing.)
The table for $g=3$ :


And finally the picture for $g=4$ :

| \# $\sim{ }^{\text {c }}$ | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 | 24 | 25 | 26 | 27 | 28 | 29 | 30 | 31 | 32 | 33 | total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 8 |  | 4 |  |  |  |  |  | $29$ | $B$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 29 |
| 9 | 1 | 2 | 10 | 28 | 71 | 104 | 147 |  |  | 145 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 508 |
| 10 |  | 21 | 72 | 210 | 356 | 557 | 660 | 819 | 1092 |  |  | 369 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4156 |
| 11 |  |  | 48 | 257 | 766 | 1791 | 2942 | 3832 | 3080 | 2804 | 3188 |  |  | 447 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 19155 |
| 12 |  |  |  | 55 | 487 | 2033 | 4734 | 8585 | 12145 | 13523 | 8500 | 5168 | 4707 |  |  | 313 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 60250 |
| 13 |  |  |  |  | 56 | 548 | 3087 | 9661 | 19112 | 27552 | 31293 | 27717 | 14629 | 5427 | 3876 |  |  | 111 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 143069 |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  | 46 | 590 | 3519 | 13251 | 32388 | 52870 | 61747 | 53398 | 35540 | 15787 | 3173 | 1827 |  |  | 20 |  |  |  |  |  | 274156 |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 41 | 489 | 3584 | 14749 | 41049 | 78373 | 102880 | 95709 | 61646 | 28311 | 10626 | 965 | 465 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  | 438888 |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 27 | 356 | 2814 | 13781 | 42566 | 90877 | 135278 | 138221 | 100392 | 48096 | 13094 | 4195 | 115 | 49 |  |  |  |  | 589861 |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 14 | 231 | 1854 | 9704 | 34955 | 83859 | 141210 | 163710 | 125842 | 68515 | 24978 | 2942 | 837 |  |  |  |  | 658651 |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 96 | 989 | 5258 | 20307 | 56939 | 110240 | 150023 | 136642 | 75688 | 27646 | 8127 | 172 | 46 |  |  | 592177 |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 25 | 300 | 2109 | 8414 | 25220 | 57598 | 92985 | 105424 | 77316 | 29771 | 5059 | 1302 |  |  | 405527 |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 6 | 52 | 401 | 2181 | 6905 | 17039 | 32977 | 45891 | 44939 | 27879 | 7828 | $E$ | $F$ | 186098 |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | $9$ | 36 | 205 | 876 | 2328 | 4882 | 8272 | 10236 | 9024 | 5094 | 1332 | 42294 |
| total | 1 | 23 | 130 | 550 | 1736 | 5079 | 12201 | 26961 | 52634 | 94210 | 152635 | 226658 | 307010 | 378728 | 426503 | 433576 | 401122 | 330227 | 246055 | 158812 | 91995 | 43347 | 18200 | 5094 | 1332 | 3414819 |

This already displays typical features:

- Entries lies in the angle between $\{c=\# \sim\}$ (left) and $\{c=2 \# \sim\}$ (right critical line).
- Entry A: only generator in first column $(c=2 g+1)$ the $(2,2 g+1)$-torus knot, giving the series of odd pretzel knots.
- Entry B: only non-zero entry in first row $(\# \sim=2 g)$. Generators look like a disk with $2 g$ Hopf bands plumbed. [explain how and linking graph] For genus $g=2$ gives, and for $g>2$ includes the 2-bridge knot generator (where linking graph is a tree).
- Entry C: maximal generators on left critical line $(c=\# \sim=6 g-$ $3)$. Correspond to planar bipartite 3 -connected cubic graphs with odd number of spanning trees. $\exists$ for $g=1$ ( $\theta$-curve) and $g \geq 6$, but not for $g=2, \ldots, 5$.
[Aside: let $G$ be planar bipartite graph, and $t(G)$ the number of spanning trees of $G$. Then:

$$
\begin{aligned}
t(G) \equiv 3 \bmod 4 & \Longrightarrow \quad \chi(G) \equiv 3 \bmod 4 \\
t(G) \equiv 1 \bmod 4 & \Longrightarrow \quad \chi(G) \equiv 1 \bmod 4 \\
t(G) \equiv 2 \bmod 4 & \Longrightarrow \quad \chi(G) \equiv 0 \bmod 2
\end{aligned}
$$

The only proof I know uses knot theory. A graph-theoretic proof?]

- Entry D: maximal generators with $c=6 g-2$ crossings. Always zero; even for links. ( $\nexists$ triangulation of the square with even valence vertices.)
- Entries E and F: final two columns. These are $c=10 g-7$ and $10 g-8$ (for $g>1$ ). Non-zero (V. examples), and only non-zero entries in their column: all generators are maximal for $10 g-8$ (when $g>2$ ) and $10 g-7$ crossings (for $g>1$ ).

How do I obtain these tables? This is far from routine. Every new genus requires an entirely different idea!

- $g=1$ is easy and 'folklore' (apart from Brittenham, observed also by Rudolph)
- $g=2$ using a check in the knot tables
- $g=3$ using Wicks forms: in Bacher-Vdovina's list of maximal genus 3 Wicks forms, replace each letter by 0,1 or 2 unlinked crossings and test realizability. Took 3-4 days (on computer).
- $g=4$ using the (reverse) Hirasawa algorithm. 8 minutes for $g=3$, and $11 / 2$ months for $g=4$.
- $g=5$ is (probably forever?) hopeless
[explain Hirasawa algorithm]
Fact 18.
Hirasawa
algorithm S-V
every series $\subset$ a special series $\subset$ maximal (generator) series, and Seifert graph of maximal series is (2-)3-valent.

Note: if $D$ is in the series with Seifert graph $G$, then $\# \sim(D)=\#$ edges in $G$ after removing val-2 vertices

This way I was able to obtain also the bottom rows for $g=5,6$.
Method: plantri of Brinkmann and McKay + symmetry groups calculated by MATHEMATICA ${ }^{\mathrm{TM}}$.

Small application.

$$
\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{a_{2 n \pm 1, g}}{a_{2 n, g}}=\frac{\# \text { max odd generators }}{\# \text { max even generators }}
$$

evaluates as follows:

| genus | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| \# m.e. generators | 0 | 1 | 74 | 21124 | 8307392 | 3971937256 |
| \# m.o. generators | 1 | 1 | 84 | 21170 | 8310928 | 3971965116 |
| $\frac{\text { odd }}{\text { even }} \approx$ | $\infty$ | 1 | 1.3514 | 1.00218 | 1.00043 | 1.00001 |

Combinatorialists know enough to ascertain:
Theorem 19.

$$
\frac{\# \text { maximal odd gens of genus } g}{\# \text { maximal even gens of genus } g} \xrightarrow[g \rightarrow \infty]{\stackrel{\text { exp. fast })}{\rightarrow}} 1 .
$$

Something we don't know is:
Conjecture 20.
\# max odd gens of genus $g>\#$ max even gens of genus $g \quad($ for $g>1$ )

There is an explanation of both statements from the B-V work (later).

## 6. Further applications of generators

[only keywordwise, since would get too long]

- enumeration problems (already discussed)
- hyperbolic volume (more below)
- signature of positive (and $k$-almost positive) links
- exactness of the Morton-Williams-Franks braid index inequality and existence of minimal string Bennequin surfaces for alternating knots up to genus 4
- conjectures of Hoste and Fox (Trapezoidal conjecture) on Alexander polynomial of alternating knots (up to genus 4)
- Thurston-Bennequin invariant for Legendrian (and transverse) links
- non-triviality of the Jones $(k \leq 3)$ and skein (HOMFLY-PT) polynomial ( $k \leq 4$; in special diagrams $k=5$ ) of $k$-almost positive knots
- examples of unsharp Morton inequality for canonical genus
- crossing number estimates for semiadequate links
- wave move unknotting conjecture and number of Reidemeister moves needed for unknotting
- hyperbolicity of the canonical genus two knots


## 7. Back to hyperbolic volume

Recall we were interested in $v_{\chi}$ from (2).
3-conn. 3-valent planar graph $G \rightarrow$ unoriented link $L_{G}$ :


Fact $18+$ Thurston's hyperbolic surgery theorem $\Rightarrow$
Corollary 21.

$$
\begin{equation*}
v_{\chi}:=\max _{\chi(G)=\chi} \operatorname{vol}\left(L_{G}\right), \tag{6}
\end{equation*}
$$

maximum taken over 3-connected 3-valent planar graphs. (And the supremum $v_{\chi}$ is attained by special alternating links.)

So the question is now: what is $\operatorname{vol}\left(L_{G}\right)$ ?
For the following let

$$
\begin{aligned}
& V_{0} \approx 1.01494, \quad \text { volume(regular ideal tetrahedron) }, \\
& V_{8} \approx 3.66386, \quad \text { volume(regular ideal octahedron) } .
\end{aligned}
$$

and

$$
\begin{equation*}
\theta=0 \text { the theta-curve } \tag{7}
\end{equation*}
$$

## Estimates.

- 'easy' observation (Brittenham '98): $\operatorname{vol}(L) \leq 4 V_{0} c(L)(c(L)$ crossing number $) \Rightarrow \operatorname{vol}\left(L_{G}\right) \leq 16 V_{0} \# \sim(D)$;
- (Lackenby '04) $\operatorname{vol}\left(L_{G}\right) \leq 16 V_{0}(\# \sim(D)-1)$ [in fact works for twist number $t(D) \leq \# \sim(D)] \Rightarrow$

$$
v_{\chi} \leq 16 V_{0}(-3 \chi-1)
$$

- Agol and D. Thurston (appendix to Lackenby's paper) $\Rightarrow$ factor $16 \rightarrow 10$ (and asymptotically sharp, but not for fixed $\chi$ )
- better approach: v.d. Veen '08 (+C.Adams '85, C.Atkinson '09); below

Disclaimer! The following pictures are taken from R. v.d. Veen, The volume conjecture for augmented knotted trivalent graphs, Algebr. Geom. Topol. 9(2) (2009), 691-722.
[now we explain a bit of v.d.Veen's work]
$G \subset S^{3}$ graph; $N(G)$ neighborhood of $G$. Want hyp. structure on $S^{3} \backslash N(G)$.
If all $\partial N(G)$ is cusp, structure is independent under vertex slide and not interesting (in particular no planar $G$ is hyp.)

Thus different structure:

- each vertex of $G$ : geodesic 2 -sphere
- each edge of $G$ : geodesic cylinder $\rightarrow$ cusps (later link components)


If $S^{3} \backslash N(G)$ is hyp. (and $G \neq \theta 3$-connected planar always ok; see below), some sort of (Mostov) rigidity holds $\Rightarrow \exists$ volume; graph volume $\operatorname{vol}(G)$ of $G$.

Definition 22. vdV's moves (which turn $G$ into a link):

- (un)zipping (almost same as (5)) preserves volume

- composition (essentially) '\#' adds volumes


When $G_{2}=\tau$, triangle $\triangle$ move ( vdV considers only this case $)$ :


Note: despite that \# is highly ambiguous, additivity

$$
\operatorname{vol}\left(G \# G^{\prime}\right)=\operatorname{vol}(G)+\operatorname{vol}\left(G^{\prime}\right)
$$

holds for all possible ways of doing ' $\#$ '!
$G(\neq \theta)$ planar $\Rightarrow S^{3} \backslash N(G)=2$ (equal) ideal $\pi / 2$-angled polyhedra with 1-skeleton $=$ median graph of $G$ (realizable by Andreev's theorem when $G$ 3 -conn.) $\Rightarrow G$ hyperbolic.

Zipping $\Rightarrow$

$$
\operatorname{vol}\left(L_{G}\right)=\operatorname{vol}\left(G^{\prime}\right),
$$

where $G^{\prime}$ is obtained from $G$ by $\triangle$ move at each vertex $\Rightarrow$

$$
\operatorname{vol}\left(L_{G}\right)=\operatorname{vol}(G)+2 V_{8} \cdot v(G)
$$

with $v(G):=\#\{$ vertices of $G\}$.
By using Atkinson's estimate on polyhedral volume:
Proposition 23.

$$
\begin{equation*}
V_{8}(-6 \chi-2) \leq v_{\chi} \leq V_{8}(-7 \chi-1) \tag{9}
\end{equation*}
$$

Remark 24. Lower bound attained when we glue only octahedra; for $G=$ $\tau \# \tau \# \ldots \# \tau$. VdV proves Volume conjecture for (unzippings of) such $G$.

More generally, iterated composition shows:
Corollary 25. $\exists$ 'stable volume- $\chi$ ratio'

$$
\delta=\lim _{\chi \rightarrow-\infty} \frac{v_{\chi}}{(-2-6 \chi) V_{8}}=\sup _{\chi<0} \frac{v_{\chi}}{(-2-6 \chi) V_{8}}
$$

and

$$
\begin{equation*}
1 \leq \delta \leq \frac{7}{6} \tag{10}
\end{equation*}
$$

Computation (below) improves lower bound to $\approx 1.08796 \Rightarrow$ upper bound sharp up to $<10 \%$.

## Computation.

first simplification
instead of $\operatorname{vol}\left(L_{G}\right)$ can calculate $\operatorname{vol}\left(L_{G}^{\prime}\right)$ : unzip $G$ along a perfect matching.
Definition 26. Perfect matching $S \subset\{$ edges of $G\}$ s.t. $\forall$ vertex of $G!\exists$ incident edge $\in S$.
$L_{G}^{\prime}$ has (at least) 3 times fewer crossings than $L_{G}$ ! (Faster to obtain vol with J.Weeks' SnapPea)


$L_{\tau}$

Remark 27. Always $\exists$ perfect matching (in fact, $\exists$ exponentially many, a 40-year-old problem solved recently Esperet-Kardoš-King-Král'-Norine '11). second simplification
composition $\Rightarrow$ enough to consider cyclically 4-connected (c4c) $G$.
Definition 28. Cubic $G$ cyclically 4-connected $: \Leftrightarrow \leq 3$ edges disconnecting $G$ are 3 edges incident to a vertex of $G$ (in particular, 3-conn.)

Or: $G=G_{1} \# G_{2} \Rightarrow G_{1}=\theta$ or $G_{2}=\theta$

Result:

| $\chi$ | $\# \mathrm{c} 4 \mathrm{c} G$ | $\operatorname{max.}$ vol. $v_{\chi} \approx$ | $\frac{v_{\chi}}{(-2-6 \chi) V_{8}} \approx$ |
| ---: | ---: | :--- | :--- |
| -1 | 0 | $4 V_{8}$ | 1 |
| -2 | 1 | $10 V_{8}$ | 1 |
| -3 | 0 | $16 V_{8}$ | 1 |
| -4 | 1 | 82.7139821 | 1.02616 |
| -5 | 1 | 105.8287878 | 1.03159 |
| -6 | 2 | 129.3489143 | 1.03835 |
| -7 | 4 | 153.3818722 | 1.04659 |
| -19 | 136610879 | 444.7966230 | 1.08394 |
| -20 | 765598927 | 469.2471319 | 1.08538 |
| -21 | 4332047595 | $493.7021266(?)$ | $1.08669(?)$ |
| -22 | $?$ | $518.1952668 ?$ | $1.08796 ?$ |

(Last row uses only - heuristically - cycl. 5-conn. graphs.)
Conjecture 29. Right ratio always rising, i.e., maximal $\operatorname{vol}(G)$ attained for c4c $G$. (In fact, can conjecture c5c for $\chi \leq-12$.)

## 8. The relation between volume and the $s l_{N}$ polynomial

We studied maximal volume $v_{\chi}$ for links: if $\chi_{c}(L)=\chi$, then $L$ has $n=$ $2-\chi, \chi, \ldots, \chi \bmod 2(\in\{1,2\})$ components.

How about fixing $n$ (in particular knots $n=1$ )?
Definition 30. Recall marking $O:\{$ vertices of $G\} \rightarrow\{+,-\}$ and thickening (4) we call $S=S_{G, O}$.
Let $L_{G, O}=\partial S_{G, O}$ and $n_{G, O}=n\left(L_{G, O}\right)$ be $\#$ of components.
Again for $\chi(G)=\chi$, have $n=n_{G, O}=2-\chi, \chi, \ldots, \chi \bmod 2$ components. Call O

- even/odd if diagram of $L_{G, O}$ has even/odd crossings,
- minimal if $L_{G, O}$ has $n\left(L_{G, O}\right)=1$ or 2 components, and
- spherical if $L_{G, O}$ has $n=2-\chi$.
[starting again a (last) detour]
Thickenings occur in the calculation of the $s l_{N}$ polynomial.
Theory of Vassiliev invariants (Kontsevich, Bar-Natan): for a (semisimple) Lie algebra $\mathfrak{g} \exists$ invariant, weight system, $W_{\mathfrak{g}}$ of (uni-)trivalent graphs $G$.
For $\mathfrak{g}=s l_{N}$ the polynomial $W_{s l_{N}}(G)=W_{N}(G)$ can be calculated by:

$$
W_{N}(G)=W_{N,+}(G)-W_{N,-}(G)
$$

with

$$
W_{N,+/-}(G)=\sum_{O \text { even/odd }} N^{n_{G, O}}
$$

$W_{N}(G) \in \mathbb{Z}[N]$; only even or odd degree terms, maximal possible degree $2-\chi$.
Theorem 31 (Bar-Natan's version of Four color theorem 4CT).

$$
\begin{aligned}
\#\{\text { spherical markings of } G\} \neq 0 & \Rightarrow \#\{\text { four-colorings of } G\} \neq 0 \\
\| & 12 \text { (if } G \text { planar) }
\end{aligned}
$$

Little else known on $W_{N}(G)$.
Easy:

$$
W_{N}(\theta)=2 N\left(N^{2}-1\right) \mid W_{N}(G), \quad \text { and } \quad W_{N}^{\prime}(G):=\frac{W_{N}(G)}{W_{N}(\theta)}
$$

has only even/odd powers.
Lemma 32. $W_{N}^{\prime}\left(G_{1} \# G_{2}\right)=W_{N}^{\prime}\left(G_{1}\right) W_{N}^{\prime}\left(G_{2}\right) \quad(f o r \underline{\text { all ' } \# \text { '). }}$

Remark 33. Vogel '96 introduced an algebra $\Lambda$ and proved something similar (under restrictions) for arbitrary Lie (super) algebra (showing $\exists$ non-Lie algebraic weight systems).

Recall that degree 1 (=knot markings) studied by B-V.
Definition 34 (following B-V). Call a vertex of $G$ good/bad in a marking $O$ if changing marking of $v$ in $O$ preserves/changes $n_{G, O}$.

Lemma 35 (B-V). A knot marking $O$ for $G$ with $\chi(G)=1-2 g$ has $2 g$ bad and $2 g-2$ good vertices.
$(\Rightarrow$ number of good/bad vertices independent of $O$ and depends on $G$ only via $\chi(G)!)$

Corollary 36. If $G \neq \theta$ (even non-planar),

$$
\left[W_{N,+}(G)\right]_{1}=\left[W_{N,-}(G)\right]_{1} \quad \Rightarrow \quad\left[W_{N}(G)\right]_{1}=0
$$

Modding out by symmetries of $G$ returns us to maximal generators:

- It is known that symmetries fade (fast) when $g \rightarrow \infty \Rightarrow$ theorem 19 .
- Even markings still seem to have a few more symmetries than odd markings $\Rightarrow$ conjecture 20.

Remark 37. Nothing similar to lemma 35 true for $n>1$. Of course, by lemma 32: $G=G_{1} \# \ldots \# G_{n} \Rightarrow$ often low degree terms vanish, but many c4c $G$ have degree 2 or 3 terms.

But there is a criterion for good vertices in the general case:
Theorem 38. $\exists$ good vertex of $(G, O) \Longleftrightarrow$ a component of diagram of $L_{G, O}$ has a self-crossing.

If G 2-connected, Whitney's theorem $\Rightarrow$ spherical markings are even.

Corollary 39. G 2-connected (cubic), $O$ non-spherical marking $\Rightarrow \exists O^{\prime}$ of opposite parity with $n_{G, O}=n_{G, O^{\prime}}$.
(In some sense a counterpart to Whitney's theorem on higher genus surfaces.)

## Relation to volume.

Computations led to the following (a priori naive) question:
Question 40. Is there a relation between $W_{N}(G)$ and $\operatorname{vol}(G)$ ? (Bluntly): does one determine other?

Analogy: both $W_{N}(G)$ and $\operatorname{vol}(G)$ behave 'well' under composition
$\Rightarrow$ look at c4c $G$.
Result:

$$
\begin{array}{ll}
\operatorname{vol}(G) \nRightarrow W_{N}(G) & G_{1}, G_{2} \text { of } \chi=-9 \text { equal vol, different } W_{N} \\
\operatorname{vol}(G) \nLeftarrow W_{N}(G) & \begin{array}{l}
\text { counterexamples only from } \chi=-15(3-4 \text { months of } \\
\text { computation and skillful programming needed!) }
\end{array}
\end{array}
$$

One pair:

$\operatorname{vol}(G) \approx 120.7043405$

$\operatorname{vol}\left(G^{\prime}\right) \approx 120.7043733$

$$
\begin{aligned}
W_{N}(G)=W_{N}\left(G^{\prime}\right)= & 10496 N^{3}-1536 N^{5}-9760 N^{7}-7100 N^{9} \\
& +6672 N^{11}+1156 N^{13}+70 N^{15}+2 N^{17}
\end{aligned}
$$

Remark 41. It is not that $W_{N}(G)=W_{N}\left(G^{\prime}\right)$ occurs seldom. E.g., in $\chi=-12$ $\exists 1357$ c4c graphs, 617 coincidences of $W_{N}$ (i.e., 740 diff. values)

In $10^{5}$ 's of computed c4c examples (til $\chi=-17, \approx 55 \%$ of $\chi=-18$ ), $W_{N}(G)=$ $W_{N}\left(G^{\prime}\right) \Rightarrow \operatorname{vol}(G)=\operatorname{vol}\left(G^{\prime}\right)$, and even in discrepancies $W_{N}$ predicts vol with unusual accuracy:

$$
\frac{\left|\operatorname{vol}(G)-\operatorname{vol}\left(G^{\prime}\right)\right|}{\operatorname{vol}(G)}<6 \cdot 10^{-7}
$$

So what is mystery around question 40 ? Why answer so little naive?

## 9. Independence of volume on number of components

[end of the last detour]
Recall: how about maximal volume of knots (or fixed number of link components)?

$$
\begin{equation*}
v_{n, \chi}=\sup \left\{\operatorname{vol}(L): \chi_{c}(L)=\chi, n(L)=n\right\} \tag{11}
\end{equation*}
$$

New version of (6),

$$
v_{n, \chi}:=\max _{\chi(G)=\chi} \operatorname{vol}\left(L_{G}\right)
$$

changes by taking only $G$ with $n$-component markings.
Thus: what (3-conn. cubic planar) $G$ have $n$-component markings?

Lemma 42. G has n-component non-spherical marking $\Rightarrow \exists n+2$-component.

Proof (easy). Take $n$-component marking $O$ and successively make all signs $+($ or -$)$ to get spherical marking.

So question is: given $G$ what is minimal component marking, $\min \operatorname{deg}_{N} W_{N, \pm}$ ? Example 43. Can be arbitrarily large! Consider the 'ladder' $A_{n}$ of $n$ stairs (or spokes); for $n=6$

$A_{n} \rightarrow B_{n}$ by $\triangle$ move $(\ldots \# \tau)$ at each vertex. Then

$$
\min \operatorname{deg}_{N} W_{N, \pm}\left(B_{n}\right) \geq \frac{1}{6} v\left(B_{n}\right) \rightarrow \infty .
$$

(Question: 'worst' case?)
When $\exists$ minimal marking ( $\min \operatorname{deg} \leq 2$ )? Maybe such examples arise because we build \# in the 'wrong' way?

Lemma 44. $G_{1}, G_{2}$ planar 3-conn. cubic graphs w/ minimal marking $\Rightarrow$ $\exists$ a way to do $G_{1} \# G_{2}$ s.t. it has minimal marking.
(Proof uses again B-V lemma 35.)
So question reduces to c4c graphs. Also $n=2$ reduces easily $n=1$, and we are back to knots. Of course,
knots $\Rightarrow$ knot markings $\Rightarrow$ Wicks forms $\Rightarrow$ Vdovina constructions $\alpha, \beta, \gamma$ give exact description, but it's recursive and takes no account of c4c. So I crunched a bit until I had what I wanted:

Theorem 45. Every cyclically 4-connected planar 3-valent graph of odd $\chi$ has a knot marking.
... with the intended application:
Corollary 46. $v_{n, \chi}=v_{\chi}$, i.e., maximal volume independent of number of components.

Proof. Take $G$ with maximal $\operatorname{vol}\left(L_{G}\right)$ (for given $\chi$ ), decompose it into c4c pieces, (get a minimal marking on each c4c piece,) and put the pieces correctly together.

Remark 47. If conjecture 29 is true, then this whole 'rearrangement' is unnecessary.

## Thank you!

Alexander Stoimenow<br>(GIST College, Gwangju, Korea)

Thursday, September 25, 2016

KIAS, Seoul, Korea

